#### REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD

#### MINUTES OF MEETING

February 23, 2011

The Real Estate Appraiser Board met at the Department of Professional and Occupational Regulation, 9960 Mayland Drive, Richmond, Virginia. The following Board members were present:

Diane Quigley, Chair Richard Pruitt John C. Harry H. Glenn James Ryan A. Myers Betsy Critzer Michael Miller Sandra Johnson Laura Sanchez del Solar

DPOR Staff present for all or part of the meeting included:

Gordon Dixon, Director
Nick Christner, Deputy Director
Mark Courtney, Deputy Director
Christine Martine, Executive Director
Kevin Hoeft, Board Administrator
Bonnie Rhea Adams, Director of Complaint
Analysis, & Resolution
Earlyne Perkins, Legal Analyst
Emily Trent, Administrative Assistant

Elizabeth Peay from the Office of the Attorney General was present.

Chair Diane Quigley called the meeting to order at 10:20 AM.

Call to Order

A motion was made by Mr. Harry and seconded by Mr. James to approve the agenda. The motion passed unanimously. Members voting "Yes" were Critzer, Harry, James, Johnson, Miller, Myers, Pruitt, Quigley, and Sanchez del Solar.

Approval of Agenda

A motion was made by Mr. Pruitt and seconded by Mr. Miller to approve the following minutes: November 9, 2010, Board Meeting;

**Approval of Minutes** 

November 9, 2010, Informal Fact-Finding Conference; December 15, 2010, Informal Fact-Finding Conference; and January 12, 2011, Informal Fact-Finding Conference. The motion passed unanimously. Members voting "Yes" were Critzer, Harry, James, Johnson, Miller, Myers, Pruitt, Quigley, and Sanchez del Solar.

Jayne Allen addressed the Board concerning USPAP compliance with the new FNC & FMC requirements. No action was taken by the Board.

David W. Witt addressed the Board concerning the appraiser examination. No action was taken by the Board.

Mark White addressed the Board concerning the changes the AQB made to the appraiser examinations in 2008. No action was taken by the Board.

Pat Turner addressed the Board concerning unlicensed AMC's. No action was taken by the Board.

of File In the matter Number 2011-02720, Diarra K. Hall, the Board reviewed the application file, the transcript, and exhibits from the Informal Fact-Finding Conference, and the Summary of the Informal Fact-Finding Conference of the presiding Board member. A motion was made by Ms. Quigley and seconded by Mr. Pruitt to accept the recommendation contained in the Summary of the Informal Fact-Finding Conference to deny Mr. Hall's application for a Certified Residential Real Estate Appraiser license. reviewing the facts, the Board is of the opinion that Hall does not have the full knowledge or understanding of real estate appraising for the level of license he is seeking. The Board determined that due to Hall having limited appraisal experience since the three recent disciplinary cases occurred, and that Hall does not demonstrate a thorough understanding of complex appraisal concepts, and it denies the application for an upgrade of license at this time. The motion passed unanimously. Members voting "Yes" were Harry, James, Johnson, Miller, Myers, Pruitt, Quigley, and Sanchez del Solar.

As the presiding Board member, Ms. Critzer did not vote or participate in this matter.

In the matter of File Number 2010-05545, Joseph Wayne

**Public Comment** 

<u>File Number 2011-02720,</u> Diarra K. Hall

File Number 2010-05545,

Winborne, the Board reviewed the Consent Order as seen and agreed to by Mr. Winborne. A motion was made by Mr. Miller and seconded by Mr. Harry to accept the proposed Consent Order wherein Mr. Winborne admits 2 violations of 18 VAC 130-20-180.D (Count 1) of the Board's 2008 Regulations, a violation of 18 VAC 130-20-180.D (Count 2) of the Board's 2008 Regulations, and a violation of 18 VAC 130-20-180.D (Count 3) of the Board's 2008 Regulations, and agrees to a monetary penalty of \$1,250.00 for the violations contained in Count 1, \$500.00 for the violation contained in Count 2, \$1,200.00 for the violation contained in Count 3, as well as \$150.00 in Board costs for a total of \$3,100.00. In addition, Winborne is required to complete a classroom 15-hour USPAP course approved by The Appraisal Foundation or the Board within six (6) months of the execution of the Order. Such course shall not be a distance education course ("distance education" means an educational process based on the geographical separation of provider and student, i.e., CD-ROM, on-line learning, correspondence courses, etc.). Upon successful course completion, Winborne shall provide the Board with proof of passing the exam. In addition, Winborne is required to complete a classroom Upper Level Residential Appraisal Course approved by the Appraisal Foundation or the Board within six (6) months of the execution of the Order. Such course shall be a minimum of 30 classroom hours and shall not be a distance education course ("distance education" means an educational process based on the geographical separation of provider and student, i.e., CD-ROM, on-line learning, correspondence courses, etc.). Upon successful course completion of the above-referenced course, Winborne shall provide the Board with proof of passing the exam. It is acknowledged that satisfactory completion of the above-referenced course will not count towards any continuing or pre-license education requirements needed for license renewal, reinstatement, or upgrade. The motion passed unanimously. Members voting "Yes" were Harry, James, Johnson, Miller, Myers, Pruitt, Quigley, and Sanchez del Solar.

As the Board member who reviewed the file, Ms. Critzer did not participate in the discussion or vote on this matter.

In the matter of **File Number 2010-05179**, **Debra Flounders**, the Board reviewed the Consent Order as seen and agreed to by Ms. Flounders. A motion was made by Mr. Harry and seconded by Mr. James to accept the proposed Consent Order wherein Ms. Flounders admits to a violation of 18 VAC 130-20-180.D (Count 1) of the Board's 2008 Regulations, a violation of 18 VAC 130-20-180.E (Count 2) of the

Joseph Wayne Winborne

File Number 2010-05179, Debra Flounders

Board's 2008 Regulations, and agrees to a monetary penalty of \$300.00 for the violation contained in Count 1, \$300.00 for the violation contained in Count 2, as well as \$150.00 in Board costs for a total of \$750.00. In addition, Flounders is required to complete a classroom Upper Level Residential Appraisal course approved by the Appraisal Foundation or the Board within six (6) months of the execution of the Order. Such course shall be a minimum of thirty (30) classroom hours and shall not be a distance education course ("distance education" means an educational process based on the geographical separation of provider and student, i.e., CD-ROM, on-line learning, correspondence Upon successful course completion, Flounders shall courses, etc.). provide the Board with proof of passing the exam. It is acknowledged that satisfactory completion of the above-referenced course will not count towards any continuing or pre-license education requirement needed for license renewal, reinstatement, or upgrade. The motion passed unanimously. Members voting "Yes" were Harry, James, Johnson, Miller, Myers, Pruitt, Quigley, and Sanchez del Solar.

As the Board member who reviewed the file, Ms. Critzer did not participate in the discussion or vote on this matter.

In the matter of File Number 2010-04351, Hudson Britt Lipscomb, IV, the Board reviewed the investigative file, the transcript, and exhibits from the Informal Fact-Finding Conference, and the Summary of the Informal Fact-Finding Conference of the presiding Board member. A motion was made by Mr. Pruitt and seconded by Mr. Harry to accept the recommendation contained in the Summary of the Informal Fact-Finding Conference and find a violation of 18 VAC 130-20-180.D (Count 1), of the Board's 2009 Regulations, and a violation of 18 VAC 130-20-180.D (Count 2), of the Board's 2009 Regulations. The motion passed unanimously. Members voting "Yes" were Critzer, Harry, Johnson, Miller, Myers, Pruitt, Quigley, and Sanchez del Solar.

A motion was made by Mr. Harry and seconded by Ms. Critzer to accept the recommendation contained in the Summary of the Informal Fact-Finding Conference to impose a monetary penalty of \$100.00 for the violation contained in Count 1, and \$150.00 for the violation contained in Count 2, for a total of \$250.00. The Board also imposes the following sanctions: In addition, for Count 1 and Count 2, Lipscomb's license will be placed on probation. During the probation period, Lipscomb is required to complete one (1) classroom 15-hour USPAP course approved by the Appraisal Foundation or by

File Number 2010-04351, Hudson Britt Lipsomb, IV

the Board within six (6) months of the execution of the Order. Such course shall not be a distance education course. Upon successful course completion, Lipscomb shall provide the Board with proof of passing the exam. It is acknowledged that satisfactory completion of the above-referenced course will not count towards any continuing education requirements for renewal of license, reinstatement, or to upgrade a license. The motion passed unanimously. Members voting "Yes" were Critzer, Harry, Johnson, Miller, Myers, Pruitt, Quigley, and Sanchez del Solar.

As the presiding Board member, Mr. James did not participate in the discussion or vote on this matter.

In the matter of File Number 2010-05694, Hudson Britt Lipscomb, IV, the Board reviewed the investigative file, the transcript, and exhibits from the Informal Fact-Finding Conference, and the Summary of the Informal Fact-Finding Conference of the presiding Board member. A motion was made by Ms. Critzer and seconded by Mr. Myers to accept the recommendation contained in the Summary of the Informal Fact-Finding Conference and find a violation of 18 VAC 130-20-180.D (Count 1), of the Board's 2003 Regulations, and a violation of 18 VAC 130-20-180.E (Count 2), of the Board's 2003 Regulations. The motion passed unanimously. Members voting "Yes" were Critzer, Harry, Johnson, Miller, Myers, Pruitt, Quigley, and Sanchez del Solar.

A motion was made by Mr. Harry and seconded by Mr. Miller to accept the recommendation contained in the Summary of the Informal Fact-Finding Conference to impose a monetary penalty of \$150.00 for the violation contained in Count 1, and \$150.00 for the violation contained in Count 2, for a total of \$300.00. The Board also imposes the following sanctions: In addition, for Count 1 and Count 2, license will be placed on probation. probation period, Lipscomb is required to complete one (1) Upper Level Residential Appraisal Course approved by the Appraisal Foundation or by the Board. Such course shall be a minimum of thirty (30) classroom hours and shall not be a distance education course. Upon successful course completion, Lipscomb shall provide the Board with proof of passing the exam. It is acknowledged that satisfactory completion of the above-referenced course will not count towards any continuing education requirements for renewal of license, reinstatement, or to upgrade a license. The motion passed unanimously. Members voting "Yes" were Critzer, Harry, Johnson,

<u>File Number 2010-05694,</u> Hudson Britt Lipsomb, IV

Miller, Myers, Pruitt, Quigley, and Sanchez del Solar.

As the presiding Board member, Mr. James did not participate in the discussion or vote on this matter.

Ms. Quigley turned the position of Chair over to Mr. Harry and recused herself from the meeting.

In the matter of File Number 2010-04624, Harry M. Pough, Jr., the Board reviewed the investigative file, the transcript, and exhibits from the Informal Fact-Finding Conference, and the Summary of the Informal Fact-Finding Conference of the presiding Board member. A motion was made by Mr. Pruitt and seconded by Mr. Myers to accept the recommendation contained in the Summary of the Informal Fact-Finding Conference and find a violation of 18 VAC 130-20-180.B.1.a (Count 1), of the Board's 2008 Regulations. The motion passed unanimously. Members voting "Yes" were Critzer, Harry, James, Johnson, Miller, Myers, Pruitt and Sanchez del Solar.

A motion was made by Mr. Miller and seconded by Mr. Pruitt to accept the recommendation contained in the Summary of the Informal Fact-Finding Conference to impose a monetary penalty of \$250.00 for a total of \$250.00. In addition, the Board imposes revocation of license for the violation contained in Count 1. The motion passed unanimously. Members voting "Yes" were Critzer, Harry, James, Johnson, Miller, Myers, Pruitt and Sanchez del Solar.

As the presiding Board member, Ms. Quigley did not participate in the discussion or vote on this matter.

Ms. Quigley returned and assumed the position of Chair.

Ms. Martine opened the floor for nominations for the position of Vice-Chair of the Real Estate Appraiser Board. John C. Harry nominated H. Glenn James for the position of Vice-Chair. Mr. Myers seconded the nomination. There being no other nominations, the floor closed. The motion passed unanimously. Members voting "Yes" were Critzer, Harry, Johnson, Miller, Myers, Pruitt, Quigley, and Sanchez del Solar.

Mr. James abstained from voting in the matter.

**Transfer of Chair** 

File Number 2010-04624, Harry M. Pough, Jr.

Transfer of Chair

**Administrative Issues** 

The Board recessed from 11:21 A.M. to 11:38 A.M.

**Break** 

Board member training was conducted by Deputy Director, Mark

**Administrative Issues** 

Courtney.

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 12:43 P.M.

<u>Adjourn</u>

Diane Quigley, Chair

Sordon Dixon, Secretary

1.	Name: Diane Quigley
2.	(Name of Board Member) Title: Board Member
3.	Agency: Real Estate Appraiser Board (Name of Board)
4.	Meeting/IFF Date: February 23, 2011 (Date)
5.	I have a personal interest in the following transaction:
	(Agenda Item)
	Nature of Personal Interest Affected by Transaction:
	I declare that I am a member of the following business, profession, occupation or group, the members of which are affected by the transaction:
	☐ I am able to participate in this transaction fairly, objectively, and in the public interest.  or
	☐ I did not participate in the transaction.
6.	1 do not have a personal interest in any transactions taken at this meeting.
	Signature Date

1.	Name: Sandra Johnson
2.	(Name of Board Member) Title: Board Member
3.	Agency: Real Estate Appraiser Board (Name of Board)
4.	Meeting/IFF Date: February 23, 2011 (Date)
5.	I have a personal interest in the following transaction:
	now
	(Agenda Item)
	Nature of Personal Interest Affected by Transaction:
	I declare that I am a member of the following business, profession, occupation or group, the members of which are affected by the transaction:
	I am able to participate in this transaction fairly, objectively, and in the public interest.
	☐ I did not participate in the transaction.
6.	I do not have a personal interest in any transactions taken at this meeting.

1.	Name: Laura Sanchez del Solar
2.	(Name of Board Member)  Title: Board Member
3.	Agency: Real Estate Appraiser Board (Name of Board)
4.	Meeting/IFF Date: February 23, 2011 (Date)
5.	I have a personal interest in the following transaction:
	(Agenda Item)
	Nature of Personal Interest Affected by Transaction:
	I declare that I am a member of the following business, profession, occupation or group, the members of which are affected by the transaction:
	☐ I am able to participate in this transaction fairly, objectively, and in the public interest.
	☐ I did not participate in the transaction.
6.	I do not have a personal interest in any transactions taken at this meeting.
	2.23.11
	Signature Date

1.	Name: Betsy T. Critzer (Name of Board Member)
2.	Title: Board Member
3.	Agency: Real Estate Appraiser Board (Name of Board)
4.	Meeting/IFF Date: February 23, 2011 (Date)
5.	I have a personal interest in the following transaction:
	(Agenda Item)
	Nature of Personal Interest Affected by Transaction:
	I declare that I am a member of the following business, profession, occupation or group, the members of which are affected by the transaction:
	☐ I am able to participate in this transaction fairly, objectively, and in the public interest.  or
	☐ I did not participate in the transaction.
6.	I do not have a personal interest in any transactions taken at this meeting.
	$\frac{\int_{3}^{3} \beta_{1} \beta_{2} \beta_{3}}{\text{Signature}} \frac{2-23-2011}{\text{Date}}$

1.	Name:Michael Miller
2	(Name of Board Member)  Title: Board Member
۷.	Title. Board Montpor
3.	Agency: Real Estate Appraiser Board
	(Name of Board)
4.	Meeting/IFF Date: February 23, 2011
	(Date)
5.	I have a personal interest in the following transaction:
	(Agenda Item)
	Nature of Personal Interest Affected by Transaction:
	Nature of Fersonal interest Andread by Transaction.
	I declare that I am a member of the following business, profession,
	occupation or group, the members of which are affected by the transaction:
	,
	I am able to participate in this transaction fairly, objectively, and in the
	public interest.
	☐ I did not participate in the transaction.
	and the participate in the transaction.
6	☐ I do not have a personal interest in any transactions taken at this meeting.
O.	1 A 1
,	
	1/23 11)
1	Sign burg

1,	Name: H. Glenn James
2.	(Name of Board Member) Title: Board Member
	Agency: Real Estate Appraiser Board (Name of Board)
4.	Meeting/IFF Date: February 23, 2011 (Date)
5.	I have a personal interest in the following transaction:
	MONE
	Nature of Personal Interest Affected by Transaction:
	MOVE
	I declare that I am a member of the following business, profession, occupation or group, the members of which are affected by the transaction:
	Certified General Real Enterte Appraiser
	I am able to participate in this transaction fairly, objectively, and in the public interest.
	☐ I did not participate in the transaction.
6.	do not have a personal interest in any transactions taken at this meeting.
	Signature Pate Date

1.	Name: John C. Harry, III (Name of Board Member)
2.	(Name of Board Member)  Title: Board Member
3.	Agency: Real Estate Appraiser Board (Name of Board)
4.	Meeting/IFF Date: February 23, 2011 (Date)
5.	I have a personal interest in the following transaction:
	Nature of Personal Interest Affected by Transaction:
	I declare that I am a member of the following business, profession, occupation or group, the members of which are affected by the transaction:
	☐ I am able to participate in this transaction fairly, objectively, and in the public interest.
	☐ I did not participate in the transaction.
3.	do not have a personal interest in any transactions taken at this meeting.
	Signature $\frac{1-23-11}{Date}$

1.	Name: Ryan A. Myers
2	(Name of Board Member) Title: Board Member
3.	Agency: Real Estate Appraiser Board (Name of Board)
4.	Meeting/IFF Date: February 23, 2011
5.	I have a personal interest in the following transaction:
	$\mathcal{N}\mathcal{N}$
	/ (Agenda Item)
	Nature of Personal Interest Affected by Transaction:
	11/2
	I declare that I am a member of the following business, profession, occupation or group, the members of which are affected by the transaction:
	☐ I am able to participate in this transaction fairly, objectively, and in the public interest.
	or
	□ I did not participate in the transaction.
_	
Ь.	I do not have a personal interest in any transactions taken at this meeting.
	= $($ ) $($
í	2/23/2011
	Signature Date /

1.	Name:Richard Pruitt
2.	(Name of Board Member) Title: Board Member
3.	Agency: Real Estate Appraiser Board (Name of Board)
4.	Meeting/IFF Date: February 23, 2011 (Date)
5.	I have a personal interest in the following transaction:
	(Agenda Item)
	Nature of Personal Interest Affected by Transaction:
	I declare that I am a member of the following business, profession, occupation or group, the members of which are affected by the transaction:
	☐ I am able to participate in this transaction fairly, objectively, and in the public interest.
	☐ I did not participate in the transaction.
6.	I do not have a personal interest in any transactions taken at this meeting. $2/23/201/$
	Signature Date